MEETING AT MINISTERIAL LEVEL

Parc des Expositions, Brussels, 3 – 7 December 1990

The Trade Negotiations Committee held its fourteenth meeting at Ministerial level, under the Chairmanship of Dr. Hector Gros Espiell, Minister of Foreign Affairs of Uruguay.

Opening session of the Ministerial meeting, 3 December 1990 at 10 a.m.

The Chairman called the meeting to order and, in the presence of H.M. King Baudouin, introduced Mr. Robert Urbain, Minister of Foreign Trade of Belgium, who delivered an address (MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/1).

The Chairman thanked Mr. Robert Urbain and introduced Mr. Wilfried Martens, Prime Minister of Belgium, who delivered an address (MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/2).

The Chairman thanked Mr. Wilfried Martens and introduced Mr. Jacques Delors, President of the Commission of the European Communities, who delivered an address (MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/3).

The Chairman thanked Mr. Jacques Delors and delivered his opening address (MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/4).

The Chairman then declared the opening session of the Ministerial meeting closed, and, with Mr. Urbain and Mr. Dunkel, accompanied the King as he left the building.

First session of the Trade Negotiations Committee (TNC) meeting, 3 December 1990 at 11.00 a.m.

The agenda, as contained in the airgram convening the meeting (GATT/AIR/3146), was adopted.

Action on the report by the TNC at Officials level

The Chairman called on Mr. Arthur Dunkel (Chairman of the TNC at Officials level) to introduce the report (MTN.TNC/W/35/Rev.1).

Mr. Dunkel expressed his personal pleasure in seeing Dr. Gros Espiell in the chair, as the successor of Minister Ricardo Zerbino. His presence demonstrated once again the commitment of Uruguay to the Round. He
recalled the moment when, four years earlier, Mr. Enrique Iglesias, the then Foreign Minister of Uruguay, banged his gavel in Punta del Este to register agreement on the Ministerial Declaration which launched the Uruguay Round. At that very moment, a number of those present had asked themselves if the four-year period that governments had provided for the conclusion of the negotiations was not, in fact, too long. And with good reason. They had wondered whether the business community - the traders, manufacturers, farmers, investors, service operators, inventors, producers - and the consumers of the world could reasonably be expected to wait for four years before governments agreed on further market opening, on what the future rules of international competition should be, on whether or not there should be multilateral rules to govern trade in sectors, old or new, where none existed now. Since then, a number of far-reaching developments had occurred. These had given a new dimension to the objectives set four years earlier and raised yet another fundamental question: could a strengthened, truly multilateral and open trading system be put in place to serve as a reference point for the dramatic reforms underway in Latin America, Asia, Africa and Central and Eastern Europe, reforms to which Chairman Gros Espiell had referred earlier? The four years that had elapsed since the launching of the Round had been well spent though not, perhaps, as well as might have been hoped. It might have been possible to do better so that these days in Brussels could have been spent celebrating rather than having to face very hard decisions under the pressure of time.

The best he could say was that there was a report by the Chairman of the Trade Negotiations Committee at Officials level giving a picture of the present state of play in the negotiations. He asked the Committee to take note of the following points while considering the report:

(1) Participants had in their grasp all the ingredients necessary for a substantial package of results. In this sense the report was an impressive document.

(2) The report also highlighted the points on which even the best drafters and technicians could not offer solutions without political guidance and breakthroughs. In Brussels, therefore, the Ministers would clearly have to take their responsibilities if the work of four years were not to be lost.

(3) The report covered all subjects which the Ministerial meeting of the TNC would have to consider but was accompanied by: (i) the report of the Chairman of the Surveillance Body; (ii) the communications which participants wished to place before this meeting; and (iii) the note on the TNC meeting at Officials level on Monday, 26 November 1990 (MTN.TNC/17). A list of these documents was to be found in MTN.TNC/W/46. Participants wishing to circulate further communications in writing were, of course, free to do so.
(4) Even if the cover note to the report did not make it explicit, it was understood that no part of the report could be considered as being agreed before all parts were agreed.

(5) Since the report was self-explanatory, he did not think it would help the search for consensus to draw attention to the fact that in three areas it had not been possible to develop texts which could serve as an agreed basis for negotiations. These were agriculture, trade-related investment measures and anti-dumping action.

(6) Even where texts existed - in many cases, very detailed texts, as in rules of origin, textiles and clothing, subsidies and countervailing duties, trade-related intellectual property rights, safeguards and services to name but a few - key political decisions were needed to complete the work. The commentaries attached to the texts listed the main points which had blocked further work. Furthermore, a number of governments had submitted specific comments on some of these texts and they were to be found in the MTN.TNC/W/- series.

The following statements were made:

CANADA  The Honourable John C. Crosbie, Minister for International Trade  MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/3

COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES  Mr. Frans Andriessen, Vice-President of the European Commission  MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/4

ASEAN  H.E. Dr. Arifin M. Siregar, Minister of Trade of Indonesia  MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/1

SWEDEN  Ms. Anita Gradin, Minister for Foreign Trade  MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/5

SINGAPORE  Mr. Mah Bow Tan, Minister of State for Trade and Industry  MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/8

PAKISTAN  Mr. Malik Muhammad Naeem Khan, Minister for Commerce and Corr.1  MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/9

COUNCIL OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES  Mr. Renato Ruggiero, Minister for Foreign Trade of Italy, Presidency of the Council  MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/10

COLOMBIA  Dr. Ernesto Sanper Pizano, Minister of Economic Development  MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/11

BELGIUM  Mr. Robert Urbain, Minister for Foreign Trade  MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/2

FRANCE  Mr. Jean-Marie Rausch, Minister of Foreign Trade  MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/12
Second session of the TNC meeting, 3 December 1990 at 3 p.m.

Chair: Dr. Hector Gros Espiell (Uruguay) - for the first six statements
The Honourable Charles Mayer (Canada) - for the remaining statements

Action on the report by the TNC at Officials level (continued)

AUSTRALIA
Hon. Mr. Neal Blewett, Minister for Trade Negotiations

FINLAND
H.E. Mr. Pertti Salolainen, Minister of Foreign Trade

GREECE
H.E. Mr. Sotirios Hatzigakis, Alternate Minister of Trade

UNITED STATES
Ambassador Carla A. Hills, United States Trade Representative

ROMANIA
H.E. Mr. Constantin Fota, Minister for Commerce and Tourism

NEW ZEALAND
Hon. Mr. Philip Burdon, Minister for Trade Negotiations

THAILAND
H.E. Mr. Amaret Sila-on, Minister of Commerce

ISRAEL
Mr. Moshe Nissim, Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Industry and Trade
CHILE
H.E. Mr. Carlos Ominami,
Minister of the Economy
MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/28

POLAND
H.E. Mr. Marcin Swiecicki,
Minister for External Economic
Relations
MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/59

ARGENTINA
Mr. Domingo F. Cavallo,
Minister for Foreign Affairs
MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/30

HONG KONG
Mr. John Chan, Secretary for
Trade and Industry
MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/19

ICELAND
Mr. Stefan Fridfinnsson,
Assistant Minister for Foreign
Affairs and External Trade
MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/27

HUNGARY
Dr. Béla Kadar, Minister of
International Economic
Relations
MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/21

NORWAY
Ms. Eldrid Nordbo, Minister of
Trade
MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/31

PHILIPPINES
H.E. Mr. Jose S. Concepcion,
Jr., Secretary of Trade and
Industry
MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/29

TURKEY
H.E. Mr. Günes Taner, Minister
of State
MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/20

UNITED NATIONS
The Secretary-General (read by
Mr. Antoine Blanca,
Director-General of
Development and International
Economic Co-operation)
MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/6

FIJI1
The Honourable Berenado
Vunibobo, CBE, Minister for
Trade and Commerce
MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/32

Third session of the TNC meeting, 4 December 1990 at 10.30 a.m.
Chair: H.E. Mr. Georges Solofoson (Madagascar) - for the first nine
statements
Ms. Eldrid Nordbo (Norway) - for the remaining statements

1Written statement only
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Name and Position</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFRICAN COUNTRIES</td>
<td>H.E. Mr. Georges Solofoson, Minister for Trade of Madagascar, spokesman for the African countries</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIGERIA</td>
<td>Hon. Mr. Senas J. Ukpanah, Minister of Trade and Tourism</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MALAYSIA</td>
<td>H.E. Dato' Seri Rafidah Aziz, Minister of International Trade and Industry</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REP. OF KOREA</td>
<td>H.E. Dr. Pil Soo Park, Minister of Trade and Industry</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRI LANKA</td>
<td>Hon. A.R. Munsoor, Minister of Trade and Commerce (read by H.E. Mr. T.D.S.A. Dissanayaka, Ambassador in Brussels)</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CZECH &amp; SLOVAK F.R.</td>
<td>H.E. Mr. Vladimír Dlouhy, Minister of Economy</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRAZIL</td>
<td>H.E. Mr. Marcos Castrioto de Azambuja, Special Representative of the President of the Republic, General Secretary for Foreign Policy</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHANA</td>
<td>H.E. Mr. Huudu Yahaya, PNDC Secretary for Trade and Tourism</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERNATIONAL MONETARY FUND</td>
<td>Mr. Michel Camdessus, Managing Director</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TUNISIA</td>
<td>Monsieur M. Mouldi Zouaoui, Secretary of State for Industry and Trade</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDIA</td>
<td>Dr. Subramanian Swamy, Union Minister of Commerce, Law and Justice</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NETHERLANDS</td>
<td>Ms. Yvonne C.M.T. van Rooy, Minister for Foreign Trade</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JAMAICA</td>
<td>The Honourable David Coore, Q.C., Minister of Foreign Affairs and Foreign Trade</td>
<td>MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fourth session of the TNC meeting, 4 December 1990 at 3 p.m.

Chair: The Honourable Charles Mayer (Canada) - for the first nine statements

Mr. Wolfgang Schüssel (Austria) - for the remaining statements

Action on the report by the TNC at Officials level (continued)

KENYA
H.E. Mr. Francis K. Muthaura, Ambassador in Brussels

GERMANY
Mr. Helmut Haussmann, Federal Minister for Economic Affairs

INDONESIA
H.E. Dr. Arifin M. Siregar, Minister of Trade

PERU
H.E. Dr. Guido Pennano, Minister of Industry, Trade, Tourism and Integration

ZIMBABWE
The Honourable K.M. Kangai, Minister of Industry and Commerce

AUSTRIA
Mr. Wolfgang Schüssel, Federal Minister for Economic Affairs

CHINA
H.E. Mr. Shen Jueren, Vice Minister of Foreign Economic Relations and Trade

BANGLADESH
H.E. Mr. M. Mokammel Haque, Secretary: Ministry of Commerce

JAPAN
H.E. Mr. Kabun Muto, Minister of International Trade and Industry

YUGOSLAVIA
Mr. Boran Karadzole, Deputy Federal Secretary for External Economic Relations

WORLD BANK
Mr. Wilfried Thalwitz, Senior Vice-President, Policy, Research and External Affairs
Fifth session of the TNC meeting, 5 December 1990 at 10 a.m.

Chair: Mr. Boran Karadzole (Yugoslavia)

Action on the report by the TNC at Officials level (continued)

EGYPT
H.E. Dr. Yousri Mostafa, Minister of Economy and Foreign Trade

DENMARK
Mr. Jorgen Orstrom Moller, Secretary of State for Foreign Economic Affairs

SPAIN
H.E. Mr. Apolonio Ruiz Ligero, Secretary of State for Trade

VENEZUELA
H.E. Mr. Reinaldo Figueredo Planchart, Minister for Foreign Affairs

PORTUGAL
Mr. Fernando Faria de Oliveira, Minister of Trade and Tourism

KUWAIT
H.E. Mr. Ahmad A. Al-Ebrahim, Ambassador in Brussels

LUXEMBOURG
Mr. G. Wohlfart, Secretary of State for Foreign Affairs

MAURITIUS
H.E. Mr. Raymond Chasle, Permanent Representative to GATT

EL SALVADOR
Mrs. Ana Cristina Sol, Ambassador in Belgium

Sixth session of the TNC meeting, 5 December 1990 at 3.45 p.m.

Chair: Mr. Stuart Robinson (GATT secretariat)
Action on the report by the TNC at officials level (continued)

IRELAND Mr. Desmond O'Malley, T.D., Minister for Industry and Commerce

NICARAGUA Mr. Noel Sacasa, Executive Adviser to the Minister of Economy and Development

MALAWI Hon. R.W. Chirwa, Minister of Trade, Industry and Tourism

CUBA H.E. Mr. Alberto Betancourt Roa, Deputy Minister of Foreign Trade

BOLIVIA Mr. Guido Cespedes Argandoña, Minister of Industry, Trade and Tourism

ZAIRE Mr. Buketi Bukayi, Minister for International Co-operation

Seventh session of the TNC meeting, 6 December 1990 at 11.30 a.m.

Chair: Mr. Stuart Robinson (GATT secretariat)

Action on the report by the TNC at officials level (continued)

SENEGAL H.E. Mr. Alioune Sene, Ambassador, Permanent Representative to the United Nations Office at Geneva

HONDURAS Mr. Mario Agüero Lacayo, Deputy Minister for Economic Affairs and Trade

Eighth session of the TNC meeting, 7 December 1990 at 2 p.m.

Chair: Dr. Hector Gros Espiell (Uruguay)

Action on the report by the TNC at Officials level (continued)

The Chairman made the following statement:

"1. Our Brussels meeting has made a substantial contribution to advancing the negotiating process. I have nevertheless reached the conclusion that participants need more time to reconsider and reconcile their positions in some key areas of the negotiations. We are, therefore, not in a position
to conclude the Uruguay Round during this Brussels Ministerial Meeting. More time is also needed to ensure that the positions of all participants in the negotiations are fully taken into account, in accordance with the multilateral character of the negotiations. We shall deploy our best efforts in undertaking this task.

"In doing so, we are mindful of the need to conduct an effective evaluation of the extent to which the objectives relating to differential and more favourable treatment for developing countries are being attained.

"2. I therefore propose that Mr. Dunkel, in his capacity as Chairman of the TNC at Official level be requested to pursue intensive consultations in the period from now until the beginning of next year with the specific objective of achieving agreements in all the areas of the negotiating programme in which differences remain outstanding.

"For my part, I remain at the disposal of participants in the consultations and shall be in constant, daily contact with Mr. Dunkel.

"3. During the period in which Mr. Dunkel is conducting consultations, the TNC may be convened at any time at short notice. We request Mr. Dunkel to reconvene the TNC at the appropriate level to conclude the negotiations at the date he considers appropriate in the light of his consultations.

"4. Mr. Dunkel and I will remain in close contact throughout this process.

"5. The consultations Mr. Dunkel is to conduct will be based on the draft Final Act embodying the results of the Uruguay Round Multilateral Trade Negotiations which was submitted to the Ministerial Meeting of the TNC in Brussels (document MTN.TNC/W/35/Rev.1, dated 3 December 1990), including the cover page which refers to the Surveillance Body and the communications which various participants have sent to Brussels. Naturally, Mr. Dunkel will also take duly into account the considerable amount of work carried out during our Brussels meeting, although it does not commit any delegation. In this connection I should like to thank the Ministers who have helped me so efficiently during the past days in Brussels, namely Mr. Hassan Abouyoub, Dato' Seri Rafidah Aziz, Mr. John Crosbie, Mrs. Anita Gradin, Mr. Mats Hellstrom, Mrs. Yvonne van Rooy and Mr. Jaime Serra Puche.

"6. We wish Mr. Dunkel luck and reaffirm our determination to ensure that, with the extension of the Uruguay Round for a brief period following the Brussels conference, results will be achieved that will be significant for all participants."

The Committee took note of this statement and of the statements made in the previous sessions.